The Surrogacy Mix-Up Case

In 2021, a private fertility clinic in Taguig City became the center of controversy when a child named **Amara** was born through in vitro fertilization (IVF) and later claimed by **three different women** as her biological mother.

The clinic had handled several IVF embryo transfers on the same day due to a laboratory scheduling error. When Amara was born, inconsistencies in the documentation raised suspicion that the embryos might have been **mislabeled or cross-implanted**.

The following women filed claims:

1. **Isabel**, a business executive, who underwent IVF with her husband, **Dr. Adrian**, a fertility specialist who confirmed he was Amara's **biological father**.

2. **Jenna**, a professional model who claimed she had donated her egg but was not informed that it had been used.

3. **Grace**, a surrogate mother who carried the pregnancy but suspected the implanted embryo was not genetically hers.

To resolve the case, the court ordered **maternity and paternity testing** using **ABO blood typing** and **DNA profiling (13 STR loci)** for the child, the three putative mothers, and the biological father. The results are as follows:

Person	ABO Type
Child – Amara	O
Alleged Mother 1 – Isabel	B
Alleged Mother 2 – Jenna	B
Alleged Mother 3 – Grace	B
Biological Father – Dr. Adrian	B

Locus	Child – Amara	Biological Father – Dr. Adrian	Mother 1 – Isabel	Mother 2 – Jenna	Mother 3 – Grace	Allele Frequencies (Observed)	Maternity Index
D3S1358	15,16	16,17	14,15	15,16	16,17	14:0.18; 15:0.29; 16:0.27; 17:0.12	
vWA	16,18	16,18	14,16	16,18	15,18	14:0.20; 15:0.21; 16:0.28; 18:0.19	
FGA	21,24	21,23	24,25	21,24	22,24	20:0.10; 21:0.17; 22:0.15; 23:0.12; 24:0.24; 25:0.11	
D8S1179	12,14	14,15	10,12	12,14	13,14	10:0.09; 12:0.26; 13:0.19; 14:0.23; 15:0.11	
D21S11	29,32	29,30	30,32	29,32	28,31	28:0.07; 29:0.18; 30:0.15; 31:0.16; 32:0.20	

D18S51	13,15	15,17	12,13	13,15	13,14	12:0.12; 13:0.22; 14:0.19; 15:0.21; 17:0.08	
D5S818	11,12	12,13	11,12	11,12	10,11	10:0.13; 11:0.28; 12:0.31; 13:0.07	
D13S317	8,11	9,11	8,11	8,11	8,10	8:0.30; 9:0.10; 10:0.12; 11:0.27	
D7S820	9,10	9,11	8,10	9,10	8,9	8:0.24; 9:0.26; 10:0.25; 11:0.08	
TH01	6,9.3	6,9.3	6,7	6,9.3	6,9.3	6:0.33; 7:0.20; 9.3:0.21	
TPOX	8,11	8,11	8,11	8,11	11,12	8:0.32; 11:0.29; 12:0.07	

CSF1PO	10,12	11,12	12,11	10,12	11,12	10:0.25; 11:0.18; 12:0.31	
D16S539	11,12	12,13	12,12	11,12	12,13	9:0.09; 11:0.29; 12:0.30; 13:0.08	

1. Who is/are the possible mothers based on the blood types? Why?
2. Who is/are excluded as mother? why?
3. Encircle the obligate maternal allele in the column of Amara's DNA profile.
4. Encircle the obligate alleles present in each putative mother's profile.
    a. What does it mean if the putative mother does not have all or some of the obligate maternal allele? Why?
    b. What does it mean if a putative mother has all the obligate maternal allele? Why?
5. Compute the Maternity Index (MI).
    a. How is this computed?
    b. What does the MI signify?
6. Compute the Combined Paternity Index (CMI).
    a. How is this computed?
    b. What does CMI signify?
7. Derive the Probability of Maternity and convert it into a percentage format.
    a. How is this computed?
    b. What does PoM signify?
8. Prepare a Legal Memorandum based on the facts and results of the Maternity test.